Case 1:05-cv-00245-JJF-LPS **ECKERT SEAMANS**  Document 185 Filed 05/05/2008

Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC 300 Delaware Avenue, Suite 1210 Wilmington, DE 19801 08 Page 1 of 2 TEL 302 425 0430 FAX 302 425 0432 www.eckertseamans.com

Ronald S. Gellert Direct Dial: 302-425-0430 E-Mail: rgellert@eckertseamans.com

May 5, 2008

Honorable Leonard P. Stark J. Caleb Boggs Federal Building 844 N. King Street Lockbox 26, Room 2325 Wilmington, DE 19801

Re: Sea Star Line, LLC v. Emerald Equipment Leasing, Inc.

Case No. 05-CV-00245-(JJF)

Dear Magistrate Judge Stark:

This letter is respectfully submitted on behalf of Emerald Equipment Leasing, Inc. ("Emerald") in response to the April 30, 2008 letter submitted by Sea Star Line, LLC ("Sea Star") addressing certain discovery concerns raised by Sea Star. A telephonic hearing in this matter is scheduled for May 6, 2008 at 2:00 p.m.

## **Background**

By e-mail dated April 17, 2008 (see Exhibit "A"), Emerald's counsel advised Sea Star's counsel of continuing disputes with respect to the discovery which Sea Star was to provide to Emerald in accordance with Your Honor's Memorandum Order dated December 28, 2007 (D.I. 160). After Sea Star's unsuccessful attempt to have the Memorandum Order set aside, a further Memorandum Order dated March 3, 2008 (D.I. 177) was issued by Your Honor again ordering Sea Star to provide the requested discovery. The April 17, 2008 e-mail was sent to Sea Star's counsel after approximately five weeks of efforts to amicably resolve Emerald's concerns regarding the discovery Sea Star produced in response to the Memorandum Order. While some of those concerns were amicably addressed, some remained; hence the April 17, 2008 e-mail. It was only in response to this e-mail that Sea Star raised the discovery disputes which Sea Star now presents to Your Honor (see e-mail dated April 18, 2008 attached as Exhibit "B"). These discovery disputes relate to discovery provided by emerald over a year ago. Emerald's counsel responded to Sea Star's discovery concerns in detail, point by point, in an e-mail dated April 23, 2008 (see Exhibit "C").

## Sea Star's Discovery Disputes

In the e-mail from Emerald's counsel dated April 23, 2008 attached hereto as Exhibit "C" Emerald has responded to each of the discovery disputes raised by Sea Star in its counsel's e-mail dated April 23, 2008 attached hereto as Exhibit "C". Those discovery issues raised by Sea Star in its April 18, 2008 e-mail attached as Exhibit "B" have been reiterated, almost verbatim, in its April 30, 2008 letter submission to Your Honor. Accordingly, for its response herein, Emerald incorporates, in full, the contents of its e-mail dated April 23, 2008 attached hereto as Exhibit "C". Each of the points raised by Sea Star in its submission to Your Honor is addressed therein.

ECKERT SEAMANS

Honorable Leonard P. Stark May 5, 2008 Page 2

## Conclusion

Based on the foregoing, Emerald respectfully requests that the discovery disputes raised by Sea Star herein be overruled.

Respectfully,

Ronald S. Gellert

RSG/md Encls.

cc:

Timothy J. Armstrong, Esquire (w/encls. – By Fax)

Kathleen M. Miller, Esquire (w/encls. - by E-Mail)

M0652781